Are physiological and behavioral immune responses negatively correlated? Evidence from hormone-linked differences in men's face preferences

CrossMark

Michal Kandrik *, Amanda C Hahn, Claire I Fisher, Joanna Wincenciak, Lisa M DeBruine, Benedict C Jones

Institute of Neuroscience & Psychology, University of Glasgow, Glasgow, G12 8QB, UK

A B S T R A C T

Behaviors that minimize exposure to sources of pathogens can carry opportunity costs. Consequently, how individuals resolve the tradeoff between the benefits and costs of behavioral immune responses should be sensitive to the extent to which they are vulnerable to infectious diseases. However, although it is a strong prediction of this functional flexibility principle, there is little compelling evidence that individuals with stronger *physiological* immune responses show weaker *behavioral* immune responses. Here we show that men with the combination of high testosterone and low cortisol levels, a hormonal profile recently found to be associated with particularly strong physiological immune responses, show weaker preferences for color cues associated with carotenoid pigmentation. Since carotenoid cues are thought to index vulnerability to infectious illnesses, our results are consistent with the functional flexibility principle's prediction that individuals with stronger *physiological* immune responses show weaker *behavioral* immune responses.

© 2016 The Authors. Published by Elsevier Inc. This is an open access article under the CC BY license
(http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

1. Introduction

Pathogens have been a major selection pressure on all organisms, including humans (Schaller, 2011; Schaller et al., 2015; Schaller and Park, 2011; Tybur and Gangestad, 2011) The footprint of this selection pressure can be seen in the complex, effective mechanisms involved in the physiological immune system, such as antibody production (Czerkinsky et al., 1987). In addition to this physiological immune system, recent research has revealed the existence of a behavioral immune system that also functions to prevent and manage infectious diseases. These behavioral immune responses include behaviors, emotions, and cognitions that minimize contact with potential sources of pathogens (Tybur and Gangestad, 2011; Tybur et al., 2013).

Because behavioral immune responses can be costly (e.g., they can carry opportunity costs) the behavioral immune system would be expected to show functional flexibility. That is, the extent to which individuals are vulnerable to infectious diseases should affect how they resolve the tradeoff between the possible benefits (e.g., reduced risk of contracting infectious diseases) and costs (e.g., increased risk of incurring opportunity costs) of behavioral immune responses (Schaller et al., 2015; Tybur et al., 2013). A strong prediction of this functional flexibility principle is that individuals with stronger physiological immune responses will show weaker behavioral immune responses. However,

although studies have tested for correlations between questionnaires that measure the strength of behavioral immune responses and self-reported infectious disease frequency and/or recency (de Barra et al., 2014, Stevenson et al., 2009), only one of these studies reported significant correlations (Stevenson et al., 2009) Moreover, significant correlations in this study were observed for only one of the two behavioral immune response questionnaires administered (Stevenson et al., 2009). Thus, there is little compelling evidence that individuals with stronger physiological immune responses show weaker behavioral immune responses.

Questionnaires for assessing vulnerability to infectious disease may be prone to reporting biases, which can obscure real relationships between variables and also cause spurious associations (van de Mortel, 2008). One method for avoiding such biases is to assess vulnerability to infectious disease by examining factors that are known to moderate physiological immune responses. Recent work suggests that stress and sex hormones are related to physiological immune responses. For example, Gettler et al. (2014) reported that men with higher salivary testosterone levels had stronger physiological immunity to infectious illnesses (as indexed by salivary secretory immunoglobulin A) and reported fewer cold/flu symptoms than did men with low testosterone levels. However, Rantala et al. (2012) demonstrated that, although men with higher testosterone levels showed stronger physiological immune responses to a hepatitis B vaccine, this relationship was significantly stronger among men who also had low cortisol levels. If the behavioral immune system does show functional flexibility, Rantala et al.'s (2012) results suggest that behavioral immune responses may be

* Corresponding author at: Institute of Neuroscience and Psychology, University of Glasgow, UK.
E-mail address: michal.kandrik@glasgow.ac.uk (M. Kandrik).

weakest among men with the combination of high testosterone and low cortisol.

Aversions to cues of poor health in conspecifics are thought to be a major component of the behavioral immune system (Park et al., 2012; Tybur et al., 2013). One such cue is low levels of carotenoid-related skin color. Carotenoids are pigments found in fruit and vegetables that play an important antioxidative role in disease resistance (Hughes, 1999; Sies, 1993). If not expended in this role, carotenoids are stored in skin tissue, giving skin a yellower, darker appearance (Alaluf et al., 2002). Consequently, yellower, darker facial skin may be a cue of good health and absence of disease (Jones et al., 2016; Lefevre et al., 2013; Lefevre and Perrett, 2014; Whitehead et al., 2012a, 2012b). People also show strong aversions to faces with low levels of carotenoid cues (Lefevre et al., 2013; Lefevre and Perrett, 2014) and perceive them to be unhealthy (Whitehead et al., 2012a; Stephen et al., 2011). Such aversions are thought to function, at least in part, to minimize contact with individuals who are currently ill (Lefevre et al., 2013; Lefevre and Perrett, 2014). The tendency to perceive faces in which carotenoid cues were increased to be particularly healthy has been reported when white participants in the UK judge the health of white faces and when black participants in South Africa judge the health of black faces, suggesting these perceptions are stable across different cultures and skin-color phenotypes (Stephen et al., 2011). Moreover, the human visual system is particularly sensitive to variation in facial skin coloration, relative to similar variation in non-face stimuli (Tan and Stephen, 2013).

In the current study, we investigated whether individual differences in men's preferences for faces manipulated along the three main color axes (yellow, lightness, red; Commission Internationale de L'Éclairage, 1976) were predicted by the interaction between their salivary testosterone and cortisol levels. Men's color preferences, testosterone levels, and cortisol levels were estimated by averaging their scores on these variables across five weekly test sessions in order to obtain reliable estimates of each man's typical hormone levels and preferences. If individuals who show stronger physiological immune responses do show weaker behavioral immune responses, as the functional flexibility principle suggests, men with higher testosterone levels would show weaker aversions to the absence of color cues associated with high susceptibility to infectious disease in faces and this relationship would be particularly strong among men who also had low cortisol levels.

The functional flexibility principle suggests that the combined effects of testosterone and cortisol may predict men's preferences for facial cues associated with infectious disease risk, such as the yellower and darker coloration associated with carotenoid pigmentation (Lefevre and Perrett, 2014, Whitehead et al., 2012b), but not facial cues that are associated with illnesses that are not contagious. Since facial redness is associated with oxygenated blood and, consequently, may be a cue of cardiovascular health (Stephen et al., 2009a), we also investigated the combined effects of testosterone and cortisol on men's preferences for facial redness. By contrast with our predictions for preferences for yellower, darker coloration, we did not expect these preferences to be related to men's testosterone and/or cortisol levels.

Because the behavioral immune responses are thought to function primarily to protect individuals from contracting infectious illnesses during social interactions with both women and men (e.g., Tybur et al., 2013), we would not expect it to be modulated by stimulus sex. By contrast, responses that were specific to opposite-sex faces would implicate responses relevant to mate choice, rather than behavioral immune responses.

2. Methods

2.1. Participants

Forty-seven heterosexual men participated in the study (mean age = 21.99 years, SD = 3.19 years). All participants were students at the University of Glasgow (Scotland, UK). None of these men were

currently taking any form of hormonal supplement and all indicated that they had not taken any form of hormonal supplement in the 90 days prior to participation. Participants were all of the heterosexual men tested in the first semester who met these criteria and completed the study. One additional man was tested but excluded from the dataset because his average cortisol level was more than five standard deviations above the mean for the rest of the sample.

2.2. Face stimuli

First, digital face photographs of 10 young adult white men and 10 young adult white women were taken against a constant background and under standardized diffuse lighting conditions. Participants were instructed to pose with a neutral expression and look directly at the camera. A GretagMacbeth 24-square miniColorChecker chart was included in each image for use in color calibration. The 20 face images were then color calibrated using a least-squares transform from an 11-expression polynomial expansion developed to standardize color information across images (Hong et al., 2001).

Next, we used methods described in Stephen et al. (2009b) to independently manipulate these face images' yellowness, lightness, and redness in CIELab color space (Commission Internationale de L'Éclairage, 1976). CIELab color space is modeled on the human visual system and consists of three independent color axes: yellow (b*), lightness (L*), and red (a*). Two versions of each of the original faces were manufactured by manipulating yellow: one in which yellow was increased by 1.5 units and one in which yellow was decreased by 1.5 units. Two additional versions of each of the original faces were manufactured by manipulating lightness: one in which lightness was increased by 1.5 units and one in which lightness was decreased by 1.5 units. Two final versions of each of the original faces were manufactured by manipulating red: one in which red was increased by 1.5 units and one in which red was decreased by 1.5 units. Importantly, these color manipulations only affect the manipulated color dimension (e.g., altering redness does not affect yellowness, and vice versa) and do not affect shape information or eye color (Stephen et al., 2009b). This technique for manipulating color information in faces has also been used in many other previous studies (e.g., Whitehead et al., 2012a; Stephen et al., 2011). These color manipulations, in which color values were increased or decreased by 1.5 units, are within the normal range of coloration for white adult faces (Whitehead et al., 2012b).

2.3. Procedure

All participants completed five weekly test sessions. All test sessions took place between 2 pm and 5 pm to minimize diurnal variation in hormone levels (Papacosta and Nassis, 2011). During each test session, participants provided a saliva sample via passive drool (Papacosta and Nassis, 2011). Participants were instructed to avoid consuming alcohol and coffee in the 12 h prior to participation and avoid eating, smoking, drinking, chewing gum, or brushing their teeth in the 60 min prior to participation. Saliva samples were frozen immediately and stored at −32 °C until being shipped, on dry ice, to the Salimetrics Lab (Suffolk, UK) for analysis, where they were assayed using the Salivary Testosterone Enzyme Immunoassay Kit 1-2402 (M = 180.47 pg/mL, SD = 38.70 pg/mL) and the Salivary Cortisol Enzyme Immunoassay Kit 1-3002 (M = 0.19 μg/dL, SD = 0.08 μg/dL). All assays passed Salimetrics' quality control.

In each test session, participants also completed a facial color preference test that assessed their preference for facial yellowness, lightness, and redness. On this facial color preference test, the 30 pairs of male faces and 30 pairs of female faces (each pair consisting of two versions of a face; one version with increased color values and one version with decreased color values) were presented on a color-calibrated monitor. Participants were instructed to click on the face in each pair they