#### G Model JVAC 17584 1–4

# **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

Vaccine xxx (2016) xxx-xxx



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

### Vaccine



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/vaccine

#### Short communication

# Effective vaccine communication during the disneyland measles outbreak

#### <sup>3</sup> Q1 David Andre Broniatowski<sup>a,\*</sup>, Karen M. Hilyard<sup>b</sup>, Mark Dredze<sup>c</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Engineering Management and Systems Engineering School of Engineering and Applied Science The George Washington University WA, DC,

USA <sup>b</sup> Department of Health Promotion & Behavior College of Public Health University of Georgia Athens, GA, USA

<sup>c</sup> Human Language Technology Center of Excellence Johns Hopkins University Baltimore, MD, USA

0

#### 93 ARTICLE INFO

- 18 Social media
- 19 Twitter
- 20 Facebook
- 21 Measles
- 22 MMR

#### ABSTRACT

Vaccine refusal rates have increased in recent years, highlighting the need for effective risk communication, especially over social media. Fuzzy-trace theory predicts that individuals encode bottom-line meaning ("gist") and statistical information ("verbatim") in parallel and those articles expressing a clear gist will be most compelling. We coded news articles (*n* = 4686) collected during the 2014–2015 Disneyland measles for content including statistics, stories, or opinions containing bottom-line gists regarding vaccines and vaccine-preventable illnesses. We measured the extent to which articles were compelling by how frequently they were shared on Facebook. The most widely shared articles expressed bottom-line opinions, although articles containing statistics were also more likely to be shared than articles lacking statistics. Stories had limited impact on Facebook shares. Results support Fuzzy Trace Theory's predictions regarding the distinct yet parallel impact of categorical gist and statistical verbatim information on public health communication.

© 2016 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

#### 24 **1. Introduction**

2502 Fear of vaccination has increased the rate of vaccine refusal in recent years [1]. Herd immunity may not be achieved, exposing 26 vulnerable groups to several infectious diseases [1]. The recent 27 Disneyland measles outbreak brought national attention to this 28 growing problem. The outbreak, which started in December 2014, 29 led to 111 cases in seven states, Canada, and Mexico. This is not 30 an isolated example; failure to adhere to vaccination schedules is 31 increasing, even among educated populations [2]. 32

33 Despite the effectiveness of vaccines, there remain areas with low uptake rates, reflecting the importance of vaccine risk commu-34 nication. American Academy of Pediatrics guidelines suggest that 35 pediatricians "share honestly what is and is not known about the risks and benefits of the vaccine in question, attempt to understand 37 the parent's concerns about immunization, and attempt to cor-38 rect any misperceptions and misinformation"[3]. However, these 39 recommendations do not specify the most effective manner for 40 physicians to communicate the latest evidence-based statistics -41 the "risks and benefits" - associated with vaccines and their refusal. 42 Furthermore, communicating statistical information on its own 43

\* Corresponding author. *E-mail address:* broniatowski@gwu.edu (D.A. Broniatowski).

5

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2016.04.044 0264-410X/© 2016 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. may be ineffective or even counterproductive [4–6], and controversy has surrounded evidence that a story may be more effective than communicating statistical data [7–9].

#### 1.1. Fuzzy-trace theory

Public understanding of the meaning of risks associated with vaccination is central to communications that address vaccine refusal. Thus, we draw upon Fuzzy Trace Theory (FTT) – a leading theory of medical decision-making, which explains the process by which individuals derive meaning from information they are given [6]. Specifically, FTT emphasizes differences in the way people process precise details such as statistics ("verbatim"), versus simple bottom-line meaning ("gist")[10]. Gists emphasize categorical contrasts between decision options (e.g. "There is no chance that mercury in vaccines can cause autism, since it is not in vaccines anymore" or "if you do not vaccinate your child, there is a real chance that they could get sick"). Gist is expected to be more compelling than verbatim, although FTT holds that both are processed in parallel [10-12].

#### 1.2. Social media analysis

Vaccine devoted a special issue to the influence of social media on patients' vaccination intentions and behaviors,[1] and social

Please cite this article in press as: Broniatowski DA, et al. Effective vaccine communication during the disneyland measles outbreak. Vaccine (2016), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2016.04.044

#### 2

## **ARTICLE IN PRESS**

D.A. Broniatowski et al. / Vaccine xxx (2016) xxx-xxx

media use continues to rise, led by Facebook. More than 30% of the
general U.S. population report getting news from Facebook. Some
groups receive a majority of their news from social media,[13] and
these articles inform decisions about a range of issues, prompting
health behavior change [14,15]. Thus, social media provide an ideal
forum to study health communications, motivating an analysis of
the factors driving online sharing of articles related to vaccination.

#### 72 **2. Material and methods**

This retrospective observational study was designed to test FTT's
 prediction that vaccine-relevant articles expressing a gist are more
 likely to be shared on Facebook when compared to articles express ing verbatim statistics.

We collected a set of 39.351 news articles with 4000 words or 77 fewer, containing vaccine-related keywords published during the 78 Disneyland measles outbreak - November 18, 2014 through March 79 26, 2015 – using news search application protocol interfaces (APIs), 80 such as Google News and Bing News (Supplemental Material). 81 We asked workers using Amazon's Mechanical Turk to indicate 82 whether articles were relevant to vaccination and contained statis-83 tics, stories, or a gist (operationalized as positive, negative, or 84 85 no opinion about those who endorse or oppose vaccination, see Supplemental Material). We used the public Facebook API to mea-86 87 sure the number of times these articles were shared, each article's length, whether or not an image was present, and each article's 88 readability (Flesch-Kincaid Index). 89

Since most articles are never shared on Facebook (see Fig. 1), we
 first conducted a logistic regression analysis to examine the effects
 of stories, statistics, and gist, on whether an article was shared
 at least once, controlling for article length, presence of an image,
 and readability. The presence of images, stories, statistics, and gists

were coded as 0 = not present in article, 1 = present in article, and article length was measured in words. We next conducted a linear regression on those articles that were shared at least once, after applying a logarithmic transform to the Facebook shares data to correct for positive skew. We applied the same regression techniques to articles containing gists to determine if article sentiment (positive, negative, or none) was asociated with more sharing on Facebook.

07

80

00

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

#### 3. Results

We coded 6158 articles selected at random from our dataset, of which 4706 were relevant to vaccination. Of these, data were unavailable for 125 articles. 763 articles contained a gist.

We verified that articles expressing an opinion contained a gist by asking 210 workers to indicate whether articles also contained a bottom-line conclusion regarding vaccines or vaccine-preventable illnesses. 186 (89%) articles were classified concordantly between gist and opinion, with Cohen's  $\kappa = 0.64$ , indicating substantial agreement. We also tested 526 articles for inter-annotator agreement with Fleiss'  $\kappa \equiv 0.38$  for presence of statistics, 0.26 for stories, and 0.38 for gists.

After controlling for article length, readability, and presence of images, we found that statistics and gists, but not stories, were significant predictors of whether an article was shared at least once (see Table 1). Furthermore, linear regression showed that articles with gists were shared 2.4 times more often, on average, than articles without gists,  $t_{1678}$ Y=Y2.93, p = 0.003. Results replicated across several statistical methodologies (see Supplemental Material). Among articles with gists that were shared at least once, linear regression showed that those expressing positive opinions about both those who endorse and those who oppose vaccination



Please cite this article in press as: Broniatowski DA, et al. Effective vaccine communication during the disneyland measles outbreak. Vaccine (2016), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2016.04.044

Download English Version:

https://daneshyari.com/en/article/10962530

Download Persian Version:

https://daneshyari.com/article/10962530

Daneshyari.com