#### Energy 113 (2016) 497-508

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

# Energy

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/energy

# Co-located wind and wave energy farms: Uniformly distributed arrays

S. Astariz <sup>a, \*</sup>, G. Iglesias <sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> University of Santiago de Compostela, EPS, Hydraulic Eng., Campus Univ. s/n, 27002 Lugo, Spain <sup>b</sup> Plymouth University, School of Marine Science and Engineering, Plymouth PL4 8AA, UK

### ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 18 May 2016 Received in revised form 28 June 2016 Accepted 13 July 2016

Keywords: Wave energy Wind energy Co-located wind-wave farm Shadow effect Weather windows for O&M Levelised cost

## ABSTRACT

Co-located wave and wind energy farms can serve to tackle one of the downsides of offshore wind energy relative to its onshore counterpart: the longer non-operational periods. These are partly caused by delays to maintenance tasks due to energetic sea states preventing access. By co-locating Wave Energy Converters (WECs) in an appropriate configuration it may be possible to reduce the wave heights within the wind farm area (*shielding effect*) and thereby increase the weather windows for maintenance. Previous works analysed the improvements in accessibility obtained by configuring the co-located WECs as a peripheral barrier or interspersed within the farm. However, the former led to an insufficient wave height reduction as the distance to the barrier increased and the latter presented other handicaps, notably in respect of the submarine cable installation and the navigation of workboats. The objectives of this work are: (i) to analyse whether a uniformly distributed array may be more convenient in these respects and (ii) to carry out a comparative economic assessment. This investigation is carried out through a case study at the Horns Rev 1 wind farm by means of a high-resolution spectral wave model. Annual cost savings of up to 900,000  $\in$  are found.

© 2016 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

#### 1. Introduction

Recently, at the Paris climate conference (COP21) in December 2015, 195 countries adopted the first-ever universal, legally binding global climate deal. The agreement set out a global action plan to put the world on track to avoid dangerous climate change by limiting global warming. In this context, reducing carbon emissions and, therefore, finding alternatives to fossil fuels is fundamental. Marine energy is regarded as a promising energy source due to the vast resource available around the world [1-8]. Already well established commercially, offshore wind energy is the most developed marine renewable, with a relatively mature technology [9–11]. Tidal [12–14] and wave energy [15,16] are less developed. Notwithstanding their environmental benefits, these renewables have to be economically competitive if they are to attract significant investment [17]. Offshore wind energy has a greater resource and better availability than its onshore counterpart [18-21]; on the minus side, it involves higher initial investments and maintenance costs [22,23]. Comparatively frequent maintenance is required in the harsh marine environment [24], yet access to the turbines by

\* Corresponding author. *E-mail address:* sharay.astariz@usc.es (S. Astariz). workboats — the most cost-effective access system [22] — is only possible when the significant wave height is below 1.5 m [22,25,26]. The resulting downtime [27–30] causes significant costs and raises the power output variability, all of which may hamper the development of offshore wind.

In this context, the co-location of Wave Energy Converters (WECs) in a wind farm [31] has emerged as a solution to increase the accessibility to the wind turbines: the co-located WECs extract energy from the incident waves [32], reducing wave heights in their lee [33,34] and, consequently, improving the accessibility to the wind turbines [35–37]. Moreover, other synergies between offshore wind and wave energy can be realised through the co-located WECs [35,38], including a more sustainable use of the scarce marine space [39], a reduction in the intermittency inherent to renewables [40,41] or the opportunity to reduce costs by sharing some of the most expensive elements of an offshore project [34,42].

Within these co-located arrays, different options may be considered [43]: (i) a Peripherally Distributed Array (PDA), where WECs are placed along the perimeter of the wind farm, forming a barrier; (ii) a Uniformly Distributed Array (UDA), with WECs deployed uniformly throughout the wind farm; or (iii) a Nonuniformly Distributed Array (NDA). Previous studies [31,44] demonstrated that co-located farms increase considerably the accessibility to the wind turbines for maintenance. However, in the





ScienceDire

$A_{\rm TR}$ rated power of transformer (MVA)kpercentage of time during which the wind turbines are accessible $AWT_k$ percentage of timekcerentage of time during which the wind turbines are accessible $b$ the pile spacing (m)kkcerentage of time during which the wind turbines are accessible $b$ the pile spacing (m)mnumber of wind turbinesk $c_v$ spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> )mnumber of wind turbines $c_v$ transmission coefficient of the offshore wind turbinesmnumber of wind turbines $c_r$ trate of change of group velocity which describe the directional rate of turningNwave action density spectrum (Js) $c_r$ rate of change of group velocity which describe the directional rate of turningNwave action density spectrum (Js) $C_r$ rate of change of group velocity which describe the directional rate of turningNwave action density spectrum (Js) $C_r$ total costs ( $e$ )Nwave action density spectrum (Js) $C_r$ total costs ( $e$ )PDAPeripherally Distributed Array $C_r$ total costs ( $e$ )rdiscount rate $C_{abbe}$ cost of the PilesSmultating Waves Nearshore $C_r$ total costs ( $e$ )rdiscount rate $C_d$ depth (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m)Ttotal number of wind turbines </th <th colspan="2">Nomenclature</th> <th>Jwec</th> <th>average power production per WEC generated by the</th>	Nomenclature		Jwec	average power production per WEC generated by the
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	Arr	rated power of transformer (MVA)	k	percentage of time during which the wind turbines are
$ \begin{array}{c} eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for studless \\ \label{eq:constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m \cdot mm^2) for stu$	AWT.	nercentage of Accessible Wind Turbines during the $k$	ĸ	accessible
b the pile spacing (m) cx spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cy spatial velocities (ms the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> ) cost of the MV/HV transformer (k∈) Cy total costs (∈) cost of the MV/HV transformer (k∈) Cy total costs (∈) cy spatial velocities (ms the vin bows of a single WaveCat d depth (m) D distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WEC EMODENE turopean Araine Observation and Data Network ERDF European Regional and Development Fund H <sub>1</sub> significant wave height (m) H <sub>2</sub> significant wave height (m) H <sub>3</sub> significant wave height (m) H <sub>4</sub> significant wave height (m) H <sub>4</sub> significant wave height (m) H <sub>5</sub> wignificant wave height (m) H <sub>6</sub> wave Kleight Reduction on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m) H <sub>6</sub> wave Kleight Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs H <sub>6</sub> wave Height Reduction on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m) I <sub>6</sub> maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) J <sub>6</sub> maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) J <sub>6</sub> maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) J <sub>6</sub> maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) J <sub>6</sub> maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) J <sub>6</sub> m	1100 I K	percentage of time	К	constant with a value 0.02 kg/(m m <sup>2</sup> ) for studless
$ \begin{array}{cccc} & \text{spatial velocities in the x component (ms^{-1})} & m \\ c_x & \text{spatial velocities in the y component (ms^{-1})} & n \\ c_t & \text{transmission coefficient of the offshore wind turbines} \\ c_t & \text{transmission coefficient of the offshore wind turbines} \\ c_r & \text{tate of change of group velocity which describe the} \\ directional rate of turning \\ c_r & \text{tate of change of group velocity which describe the} \\ frequency shifting due to changes in currents and \\ water depth \\ c_r & \text{tata cost of the electricity transmission cable ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ water depth \\ c_r & \text{tata cost of the electricity transmission cable ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ water depth \\ c_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ C_r & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ D_r & \text{distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat} \\ WEC & total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ WEC & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ WEC & \text{total costs ($\epsilon M & Pitta Array (M) \\ H_i & \text{incident significant wave height (m) \\ H_i & \text{significant wave height (m) \\ H_k & \text{significant wave height$	h	the nile spacing (m)	i v	chain and 0.0219 kg/( $m \cdot mm^2$ ) for stud-link chain
$\begin{array}{cccc} & \ rate of charge of group velocity which describe the directional rate of thruge of group velocity which describe the directional rate of turning of group velocity which describe the frequency shifting due to changes in currents and water depth C_{cable} cost of the electricity transmission cable (\in/m) PDA Non-uniformly Distributed Array L total length of the catenary (m) L cost of the electricity transmission cable (\in/m) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array C_{MVHV} cost of the maximum cable (\in/m) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array C_{MVHV} cost of the MV/HV transformer (k \in) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array C_{MVHV} cost of the MV/HV transformer (k \in) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array C_{MVHV} cost of the MV/HV transformer (k \in) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array C_{MVHV} cost of the MV/HV transformer (k \in) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array C_{able} cost of the electricity transmission cable (\in/m) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array C_{MVHV} cost of the MV/HV transformer (k \in) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array C_{able} cost of the electricity and the veloce C_{able} cost of the electricity and the veloce C_{able} cost of the electricity transmission cable (\in/m) PDA Peripherally Distributed Array WEC T total costs (\in) T distonate the wave spectrum (Js^{-1}) SWAR Simulating WAves Nearshore T_p peak wave period (s) UW wind speed at 10 m. UDA Uniformly Distributed Array W_{CAM} weight of the mooring system (N) WEC WEC WEC WEC WEC WEC WHC Wave Energy Converter WKF Wind Caram We height (m) WCAM weight of the mooring system (N) WEC Wave Energy Converter WKF Wind Caram We height Reduction along the j-th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECS (m) PAW average power output of all co-located WECS (m) PAW average power output of all co-located WECS (m) PAW average power output of all co-located WECS (m) PAW average power output of all co-located WECS (m) PAW average power output of$	C <sub>w</sub>	spatial velocities in the x component (ms <sup>-1</sup> )	m	number of turbines in the <i>i</i> -th area
$ \begin{array}{cccc} & \begin{tabular}{lllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	C	spatial velocities in the v component ( $ms^{-1}$ )	n	total number of wind turbines
$\begin{array}{cccc} & rate of change of group velocity which describe the directional rate of turning (s) wave action density spectrum (Js) NDA Non-uniformly Distributed Array (m) total length of the catenary (m) (m) (m) (m) (m) (m) (m) (m) (m) (m)$	C <sub>t</sub>	transmission coefficient of the offshore wind turbines	$n_{1AZ}$	total number of WECs
odirectional rate of turning directional rate of turningNDANon-uniformly Distributed Array total length of the catenary (m) $c_r$ rate of change of group velocity which describe the frequency shifting due to changes in currents and water depthLtotal length of the catenary (m) $C_a$ drag coefficient of the piles $O_k$ Operation & Maintenance $C_{cable}$ cost of the electricity transformer (k $\in$ )PTOPower Trake-off System $C_r$ total costs ( $\in$ )rdiscount rate $C_{AUV,HV}$ catenary Anchor Leg Mooringrdiscount rate $d$ depth (m) $T_r$ discount rate $D_r$ distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WEC $T_r$ total number of time points considered $D_r$ catenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T_p$ peak wave period (s)EMDDEEuropean Marine Observation and Data NetworkUwwind speed at 10 m. $H_i$ significant wave height (m) $W_{CALM}$ Weight of the mooring system (N) $H_si$ significant wave height (m) $W_{CC}$ Wind Farm $H_{si}$ significant wave height Reduction along the j-th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs (m) $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\ell$ ) $H_{n}$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable ( $A$ ) $J_{nm}$ $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating v	CA	rate of change of group velocity which describe the	N	wave action density spectrum (Is)
$c_{\sigma}$ rate of change of group velocity which describe the frequency shifting due to changes in currents and water depthLtotal length of the catenary (m) $C_d$ drag coefficient of the piles $Q_t$ Levelised Cost of Energy $C_{acble}$ cost of the electricity transmission cable ( $\in$ /m)PDAPeripherally Distributed Array $C_{mV/HV}$ cost of the MV/HV transformer ( $k \in$ )PTOPower Take-off System $C_t$ total cost ( $e \in$ )rdiscount rateCALMCatenary Anchor Leg Mooring $S_{tot}$ energy density source terms which describe local changes to the wave spectrum ( $Js^{-1}$ )Ddistance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WECWENSimulating WAves Nearshore $D_p$ pile diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $T_p$ $D_p$ pile diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $T_p$ $PDF$ European Marine Observation and Data Network $H_s$ UDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_s$ significant wave height (m) $W_{CMM}$ weight of the mooring system (N) $H_s$ significant wave height (m) $WCMM$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $e/m$ ) $HRA_j$ significant wave Height Reduction along the j-th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs (m) $\gamma$ $H_s$ significant wave Height Reduction along the j-th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs (m) $\gamma$ $H_s$ significant wave height (m) $\gamma$ $H_s$ <td>- 0</td> <td>directional rate of turning</td> <td>NDA</td> <td>Non-uniformly Distributed Array</td>	- 0	directional rate of turning	NDA	Non-uniformly Distributed Array
frequency shifting due to changes in currents and water depthLCOELevelised Cost of Energy electricity generation (MWh) $C_{adb}$ drag coefficient of the piles $O_r$ electricity generation (MWh) $C_{adbe}$ cost of the electricity transmission cable ( $\in$ /m)PDAPeripherally Distributed Array $C_{mV/HV}$ cost of the MV/HV transformer ( $k \in$ )PTOPower Take-off System $C_r$ total costs ( $\in$ )rdiscount rateCALMCatenary Anchor Leg Mooring $S_{tot}$ energy density source terms which describe local changes to the wave spectrum ( $J_{S^{-1}}$ ) $D$ distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WEC $WEC$ SWAN $D_r$ catenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m)WECWave Sector $H_s$ significant wave height (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_{si}$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with co- located WECs (m) $\omega$ $hRF$ wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $H_{amm}$ average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $f_{amm}$ averarge gower output of all co-located WECs (W	Cσ	rate of change of group velocity which describe the	L	total length of the catenary (m)
water depth $O_t$ electricity generation (MWh) $C_d$ drag coefficient of the piles $O_k$ Operation & Maintenance $C_{cable}$ cost of the electricity transmission cable ( $\in$ /m)PDAPeripherally Distributed Array $C_{MV/HV}$ cost of the MV/HV transformer ( $k \in$ )PTOPower Take-off System $C_t$ total costs ( $\in$ )rdiscount rate $CALM$ Catenary Anchor Leg Mooring $r$ discount rate $d$ depth (m) $S_{tot}$ energy density source terms which describe local changes to the wave spectrum ( $Js^{-1}$ ) $D$ distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WEC $SWAN$ Simulating Waves Nearshore $D_c$ catenary diameter (m) $T$ total number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T_p$ peak wave period (s)EMODnetEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_{si}$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with co- located WECs (m) $\omega$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\epsilon/m$ ) $H_{k}$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\gamma$ $R_{k}$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\omega$ $\omega$ $H_k$ arcificient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\epsilon/m$ )<	U	frequency shifting due to changes in currents and	LCOE	Levelised Cost of Energy
$C_d$ drag coefficient of the pilesO&MOperation & Maintenance $C_{able}$ cost of the electricity transmission cable (€/m)PDAPeripherally Distributed Array $C_{MV/HV}$ cost of the MV/HV transformer (k€)PDPower Take-off System $C_t$ total costs (€)rdiscount rateCALMCatenary Anchor Leg Mooringrenergy density source terms which describe local $d$ depth (m) $S_{tot}$ energy density source terms which describe local $D$ distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCatSWANSimulating WAves Nearshore $WEC$ $WEC$ ta point in time $D_c$ catenary diameter (m) $T$ total number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T_p$ peak wave period (s)EMDDnetEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m) $WC_{ALM}$ weight of the mooring system (N) $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with co-located WECs (m) $\omega$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $e(m)$ $HRF$ wave arege power output of all co-located WECs (W/m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A) $I_{purm}$ average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the 		water depth	$O_t$	electricity generation (MWh)
$C_{cable}$ cost of the electricity transmission cable (€/m)PDAPeripherally Distributed Array $C_{MV/HV}$ cost of the MV/HV transformer (k€)PTOPower Take-off System $C_t$ total costs (€)rdiscount rateCALMCatenary Anchor Leg Mooring $S_{tot}$ energy density source terms which describe local changes to the wave spectrum (Js <sup>-1</sup> )Ddistance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WEC $SWAN$ Simulating WAves Nearshore $D_c$ catenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T_p$ peak wave period (s)EMODnetEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m) $W_{CALM}$ weight of the mooring system (N) $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with colocated WECs (m) $wre Start cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmissioncable that depends on the operating voltage of thecable (€/m)HRFwave Height Reduction within the Farm with co-located WECs (m)\gammacost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmissioncable that depends on the operating voltage of thecable (€/m)I_nmaximal current in the medium voltage cable (A)J_{furm}\gammacost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmissioncable that depends on the operating voltage of thecable (1/A)I_{mirrer}average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m)\gammacost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmissioncable that depends on the oper$	$C_d$	drag coefficient of the piles	O&M	Operation & Maintenance
$C_{MV/HV}$ cost of the MV/HV transformer (k€)PTOPower Take-off System $C_t$ total costs (€)rdiscount rate $CALM$ Catenary Anchor Leg Mooring $r$ discount rate $d$ depth (m) $r$ energy density source terms which describe local $d$ depth (m) $r$ changes to the wave spectrum (Js <sup>-1</sup> ) $D$ distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCatSWANSimulating WAves Nearshore $WEC$ $T$ total number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T$ total number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T$ total number of time points considered $BMODret$ European Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m) $W_{CALM}$ weight of the mooring system (N) $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m) $w$ $w$ $H_{SWECi}$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $HRF$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $1/A$ ) $I_{Mrm}$ average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that dep	$C_{cable}$	cost of the electricity transmission cable $(\in/m)$	PDA	Peripherally Distributed Array
$C_t$ total costs (€)rdiscount rateCALMCatenary Anchor Leg Mooring $S_{tor}$ energy density source terms which describe local changes to the wave spectrum (Js <sup>-1</sup> )Ddistance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WECSWANSimulating WAves Nearshore $D_c$ catenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T_p$ peak wave period (s)EMDDnetEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_s$ significant wave height (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m) $\alpha$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $HRA_j$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $I_n$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $J_{farm}$ $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A) $I_n$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $J_{farm}$ $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A) $I_n$ maximal current in the medium voltage cab	$C_{MV/HV}$	cost of the MV/HV transformer (k€)	PTO	Power Take-off System
CALMCatenary Anchor Leg Mooring $S_{tot}$ energy density source terms which describe local changes to the wave spectrum $(Js^{-1})$ $D$ distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WEC $K$ Simulating WAves Nearshore t a point in time $D_c$ catenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T_p$ peak wave period (s)EMODnetEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WFWind Farm $H_{xi}$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $H_r$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $I_n$ , $I_m$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable ( $A$ ) $J_{farm}$ $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $1/A$ ) $I_{virrer}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\psi_{wnwer}$ wave direction ( $\circ$ )	$C_t$	total costs (€)	r	discount rate
ddepth (m)changes to the wave spectrum (Js <sup>-1</sup> )Ddistance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WECSWANSimulating WAves Nearshore tD_ccatenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points consideredD_ppile diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points consideredEMODnetEuropean Marine Observation and Data NetworkUwwind speed at 10 m.EMODnetEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed ArrayH_iincident significant wave height (m)WCALMweight of the mooring system (N)H_ssignificant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WFWind FarmHRA_jsignificant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECsβcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m)HRFwave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m)γcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m)In,maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) Jfarmγcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A)Juwpower production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m)wewe direction (°)	CALM	Catenary Anchor Leg Mooring	S <sub>tot</sub>	energy density source terms which describe local
Ddistance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat WECSWANSimulating WAves Nearshore tD_ccatenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points consideredD_ppile diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points consideredD_ppile diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points consideredEMODnetEuropean Marine Observation and Data NetworkU <sub>w</sub> wind speed at 10 m.ERDFEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed ArrayH <sub>i</sub> incident significant wave height (m)WECWave Energy ConverterH <sub>s</sub> significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WFWind FarmH <sub>sweci</sub> significant height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with co- located WECs (m)∞ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m)HRFwave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m)γcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m)In,maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) Jfarmγcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A)Iwipower production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wrave}$ wave direction (°)	d	depth (m)		changes to the wave spectrum (Js <sup>-1</sup> )
WECta point in time $D_c$ catenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T_p$ peak wave period (s)EMODnetEuropean Marine Observation and Data Network $U_w$ wind speed at 10 m.ERDFEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WFWind Farm $H_{s,WECi}$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\epsilon/m$ ) $HRF$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\epsilon/m$ ) $I_n$ , $I_n$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $J_{farm}$ $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $1/A$ ) $I_{wire}$ wave ge power output of all co-located WECs (W/m) $\phi$ wave direction (°)	D	distance between the twin bows of a single WaveCat	SWAN	Simulating WAves Nearshore
$D_c$ catenary diameter (m)Ttotal number of time points considered $D_p$ pile diameter (m) $T_p$ peak wave period (s)EMODnetEuropean Marine Observation and Data Network $U_w$ wind speed at 10 m.ERDFEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m) $W_{CALM}$ weight of the mooring system (N) $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_{si}$ significant height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with co- located WECs (m)wind Farmcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $HRA_j$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $β$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $I_n$ , $I_n$ , $I_n$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $I_{jarm}$ $γ$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A) $I_{im}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $I_{wave}$ $θ_{wave}$ wave direction (°)		WEC	t	a point in time
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	$D_c$	catenary diameter (m)	Т	total number of time points considered
EMODnetEuropean Marine Observation and Data Network $U_w$ wind speed at 10 m.ERDFEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m) $W_{CALM}$ weight of the mooring system (N) $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_{si}$ significant height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with co- located WECs (m)WFWind Farm cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m)HRFwave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m)In,maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) Jfarm $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $1/A$ )Iwipower production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{waver}$ wave direction (°)	$D_p$	pile diameter (m)	$T_p$	peak wave period (s)
ERDFEuropean Regional and Development FundUDAUniformly Distributed Array $H_i$ incident significant wave height (m) $W_{CALM}$ weight of the mooring system (N) $H_s$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_{si}$ significant height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with co- located WECs (m)WFWind Farm $HRA_j$ significant neight Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $HRF$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $I_n$ ,maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $J_{farm}$ $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $1/A$ ) $W_{in}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$	EMODnet European Marine Observation and Data Network		$U_w$	wind speed at 10 m.
$H_i$ incident significant wave height (m) $W_{CALM}$ weight of the mooring system (N) $H_s$ significant wave height (m)WECWave Energy Converter $H_{si}$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WFWind Farm cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $HRA_j$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $β$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $HRF$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $γ$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $I_n$ ,maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $J_{farm}$ $γ$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A) $W_i$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $θ_{wave}$ wave direction (°)	ERDF	European Regional and Development Fund	UDA	Uniformly Distributed Array
Hssignificant wave height (m)WECWave Energy ConverterHsisignificant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WFWind Farm cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m)HRAjsignificant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECsβcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m)HRFwave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m)γcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m)In,maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) Jfarmγcost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A)Iwipower production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$ wave direction (°)	$H_i$	incident significant wave height (m)	W <sub>CALM</sub>	weight of the mooring system (N)
$H_{si}$ significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in the baseline scenario without WECs (m)WFWind Farm cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $HRA_j$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $β$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $HRF$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $γ$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $I_{n,}$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $J_{farm}$ wave production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $ψ_{wave}$ wave direction (°)	$H_s$	significant wave height (m)	WEC	Wave Energy Converter
the baseline scenario without WECs (m) $\alpha$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission $H_{s,WECi}$ significant height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with co- located WECs (m)cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $HRA_j$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $HRF$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in$ /m) $I_{n,}$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $J_{arm}$ $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $1/A$ ) $I_{wi}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$ wave direction (°)	$H_{si}$	significant wave height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine in	WF	Wind Farm
$H_{s,WECi}$ significant height incident on the <i>i</i> -th turbine with colocated WECs (m)cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $HRA_j$ significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $HRF$ wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (€/m) $I_n$ ,maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) $J_{arm}$ average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m)cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A) $I_{Wi}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$ wave direction (°)		the baseline scenario without WECs (m)	α	cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission
Incated WECs (m)Cable ( $\in/m$ )HRAjsignificant wave Height Reduction along the j-th Area of wind turbines with co-located WECs $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\in/m$ )HRFwave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable (1/A)Imaxmaximal current in the medium voltage cable (A) Jumimaximal current in the medium voltage cable (W/m)Imaxmaximal current in the medium voltage cable (W/m)maximal current in the medium voltage of the cable (1/A)Imaxpower production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$ wave direction (°)	H <sub>s,WECi</sub>	significant height incident on the i-th turbine with co-		cable that depends on the operating voltage of the
<i>HRA<sub>j</sub></i> Significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area $\beta$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmissionof wind turbines with co-located WECscable that depends on the operating voltage of the <i>HRF</i> wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co-located WECs (m) $\gamma$ <i>In,</i> maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A)cable that depends on the operating voltage of the <i>J<sub>farm</sub></i> average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m)cable that depends on the operating voltage of the <i>J<sub>wi</sub></i> power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$ wave direction (°)		located WECS (m)	0	cable $(\in/m)$
<i>HRF</i> wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m)cable that depends on the operating voltage of the cable ( $\leq$ /m) $I_{n,}$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A)cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission cable that depends on the operating voltage of the $J_{farm}$ average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m)cable that depends on the operating voltage of the $I_{wi}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$ wave direction (°)	HRAj	significant wave Height Reduction along the <i>j</i> -th Area	β	cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission
HKrwave Height Reduction within the Farm with co- located WECs (m)cable ( $\leq$ /m)located WECs (m) $\gamma$ cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission $I_{n,}$ maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A)cable that depends on the operating voltage of the $J_{farm}$ average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m)cable (1/A) $I_{Wi}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$ wave direction (°)		of Wind turbines with co-located wees		cable that depends on the operating voltage of the
$I_{n,} \qquad \text{maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A)} \\ I_{farm} \qquad \text{average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m)} \\ I_{Wi} \qquad \text{power production of the i-th WEC (W/m)} \\ \theta_{wave} \qquad \text{wave direction (°)} \\ \text{cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission} \\ \text{cable that depends on the operating voltage of the} \\ \text{cable (1/A)} \\ \text{wave direction (°)} \\ \text{wave direction (°)} \\ \text{maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A)} $	HKF	wave Height Reduction within the Farm with co-		CaDIE $(\in/\mathbb{M})$
$I_{n,}$ Information current in the medium vortage cable (A)Cable that depends on the operating vortage of the $J_{farm}$ average power output of all co-located WECs (W/m)cable (1/A) $I_{Wi}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$	T	located WECS (III)	γ	cost coefficient to calculate the electricity transmission
$J_{farm}$ average power output of all co-located weeks (w/lif) Cable (1/A) $J_{Wi}$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th WEC (W/m) $\theta_{wave}$ wave direction (°)	1 <sub>n,</sub> 1-	maximal current in the medium voltage cable (A)		cable that depends on the operating voltage of the
$W_i$ power production of the <i>i</i> -th well ( <i>v</i> /iii) $V_{wave}$ wave unection ()	Jfarm I	average power output of all co-located wees (W/M)	A	CaDie $(1/A)$ wave direction (°)
$\hat{A}_{++}$ wind direction (°)	JW,i		0 <sub>wave</sub> A	wind direction (°)
<sup>o</sup> wind Wind direction ()			<sup>0</sup> wind	

first case (PDA array) the wave height reduction achieved in the area farthest from the barrier of WECs was not enough to ensure an appropriate level of accessibility [45]. The NDA configuration, with part of the WECs forming a peripheral barrier and the remaining WECs interspersed between the wind turbines to counter wave regeneration by diffracted energy overcomes this downside, resulting in a more uniform wave height reduction [46]. However, this configuration presents other shortcomings, notably in relation to the installation of the moorings and submarine cables and the manoeuvrability of workboats for access to wind turbines and WECs, which are not facilitated by the non-uniform layout [47].

With this in view, the aim of this work is to assess the option of uniformly distributed arrays (UDAs), and in particular to determine whether this configuration may achieve similar values of wave height reduction while facilitating the circulation through the farm. For this purpose, a case study at the Horns Rev offshore wind farm is carried out in which four UDA layouts are considered. A thirdgeneration wave model, SWAN (Simulating WAves Nearshore) and real (observed) wave data are used for estimating the wave conditions within the farm. This paper is structured in four steps. First, on the basis of previous results obtained at Horns Rev 1 with PDA and NDA configurations, four UDA configurations are proposed and tested for a representative sea state. Second, the two best configurations are simulated with real annual sea data by means of the wave model. Third, the results obtained are analysed in terms of wave height reduction within the wind farm area and power production by means of indicators defined *ad hoc*. These results are then translated into monetary terms by means of the levelised cost. Finally, the results for the UDA co-located farms are compared with those for PDAs and NDAs, and conclusions are drawn.

## 2. Methodology

#### 2.1. Study area

The assessment of the UDAs was carried out by considering an offshore wind farm currently in operation: Horns Rev 1. Located off the Danish North Sea coast (Fig. 1), the water depth and distance to shore are in the ranges 6–14 m and 14–20 km, respectively. Horns Rev 1 is composed by 80 turbines (Vestas V80-2 MW) with a

Download English Version:

# https://daneshyari.com/en/article/1730757

Download Persian Version:

https://daneshyari.com/article/1730757

Daneshyari.com