



# Trends in mortality from pulmonary tuberculosis before and after antibiotics in the Portuguese sanatorium *Carlos Vasconcelos Porto* (1918–1991): Archival evidence and its paleopathological relevance



Vítor M.J. Matos<sup>\*</sup>, Ana Luísa Santos

CIAS – Research Centre for Anthropology and Health, Department of Life Sciences, University of Coimbra, Portugal

## S U M M A R Y

**Keywords:**  
Pulmonary tuberculosis  
Sanatoria  
Mortality  
Survival analysis  
Antibiotics  
Paleopathology

The comparative study of patients' profiles and outcomes from pulmonary tuberculosis (TB), before and after the discovery of antibiotic therapy, using sanatoria archives is an unexplored approach in paleopathology. Although higher mortality rates are assumed before chemotherapy, scarce information exists regarding the disease's duration in institutionalized patients and to what extent tuberculous sufferers lived enough to develop skeletal lesions. To fill this gap, 315 clinical files from the former male Sanatorium *Carlos Vasconcelos Porto*, located in *São Brás de Alportel*, Portugal, were studied. Two periods of hospitalization were considered: 1931–1944 ( $n = 128$ , Group 1) and 1955–1961 ( $n = 187$ , Group 2). The average duration of hospitalization (350.3 days for Group 1 and 371.8 for Group 2) and the crude mortality (18.2% and 11.2%, respectively in Groups 1 and 2) did not differ significantly between groups. However, Cox's regression revealed significant differences between survival curves, after adjusting for age at admission (14–74 years old), with pre-chemotherapy patients presenting a higher risk of dying during hospitalization ( $p = 0.037$ , hazard ratio = 1.94, IC95% = 1.03–3.63). This study also confirms poorer prognoses for pulmonary tuberculosis sufferers hospitalized in sanatoria before antibiotics and reveals that a significant number of patients survived enough time to develop bone lesions.

© 2015 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

## 1. Introduction

Clinical files from sanatoria are rich sources of both biological and sociocultural data. However these are poorly explored in paleoepidemiological and paleopathological studies [1]. Archival studies devoted to the comparison of the outcomes of pulmonary tuberculosis (TB) in patients interned before and after the medical use of antibiotics are virtually non-existent, nonetheless these sources can undoubtedly contribute to better understand the past history of these conditions. Yet, this issue encompasses not only the obvious historical interest but also has the potential to bring empirical evidence to the current debate around the claims for rebuilding the so-called “new sanatoria” to isolate patients affected by extensively and/or totally drug-resistant TB [2].

The main aim of this investigation is to test if before effective chemotherapy tuberculous patients presented poorer prognoses, namely higher mortality, when compared to those treated with antibiotics. Additionally, the duration of the internment period is also analyzed in order to transpose this unexplored data to the paleopathological context. Ultimately this approach also aims to evaluate if the profile of the institutionalized patients is analogous to the contemporary Portuguese population affected by TB.

These hypotheses were tested by studying clinical files from the first Portuguese private sanatorium, named *Sanatório Carlos Vasconcelos Porto* (SCVP) and located at *São Brás de Alportel*, a place recognized for its excellent climatic conditions to treat pulmonary TB [3]. The SCVP was inaugurated in 8<sup>th</sup> September 1918 and was active for 73 years. Firstly, between 1918 and 1952, it was exclusively for the internment of the male workers from the Portuguese Railways Company (*Companhia dos Caminhos de Ferro* [CP]) [1,4–6] who, according to Cabanas [7], presented a high risk of contracting pulmonary TB due to the nature of their job. Later, from 1955 to 1991, it was integrated into the public health system under the supervision of the National Institute for Tuberculosis Assistance (*Instituto Nacional de Assistência aos Tuberculosos* [IANT]). After its

<sup>\*</sup> Corresponding author. CIAS – Centro de Investigação em Antropologia e Saúde, Departamento de Ciências da Vida, Universidade de Coimbra, Calçada Martim de Freitas, P-3001 456 Coimbra, Portugal. Tel.: +351 239 854 108; fax: +351 239 854 129.

E-mail addresses: [vmatos@antrop.uc.pt](mailto:vmatos@antrop.uc.pt) (V.M.J. Matos), [alsantos@antrop.uc.pt](mailto:alsantos@antrop.uc.pt) (A.L. Santos).

closure as a sanatorium, it was adapted into the Centre of Rehabilitation Medicine of the South (*Centro de Medicina de Reabilitação do Sul*) [6].

## 2. Material and methods

This archival study was based on 315 clinical files preserved from the SCVP, which represent pulmonary TB patients interned during the two periods of activity: a) 128 files from 121 male railway workers interned between 1931 and 1944 (CP period); b) 187 files from 182 males interned between 1955 and 1961, mainly inhabitants of the Southern region of Portugal (IANT period). From the epidemiological point of view each of these periods represents distinct pulmonary TB patients groups: those treated before and after the discovery of antibiotics, and also those who lived before and after either the massive BCG vaccination or the epidemiologic transition in Portugal. This cleavage allows an interesting analytical approach by comparing the two groups of patients.

These files present detailed information collected by the medical doctors, namely the anamnesis and the patient's history – including the clinical course of pulmonary TB and co-existence of other diseases. Additionally, the medical reports of radiographic exams and sputum bacilloscopy are also available as well as the schematic depiction and description of the pulmonary tuberculous lesions, including their location, extension, prognosis and treatments.

The methodological approach for the present investigation consisted of reading all the content of the clinical files and specific data regarding patient's personal, clinical, epidemiological and therapeutic aspects. These data were gathered and analyzed statistically (SPSS Statistics, v. 19.0, IBM SPSS, Chicago, IL).

## 3. Results and discussion

### 3.1. Age at admission

The age at admission in the sanatorium ranged from 14 to 74 years old with an overall mean of 39.28 years (Table 1). No statistical differences were found between the means of the two periods

**Table 1**  
Demographical, clinical and epidemiological parameters compiled from the clinical files of the SCVP. Data for each administrative period (CP – *Portuguese Railways Company* – and IANT – *National Institute for Tuberculous Assistance*) are also presented.

	Total	CP (1931–1944)	IANT (1955–1961)
Clinical files (n)	315	128	187
Patients (n)	303	121	182
Age at admission (n)	282	100	182
Age range (years)	14–74	25–68	14–74
Mean	39.28	40.20	38.77
Median	39.0	39.00	38.00
Std. deviation	11.8	8.36	13.03
Duration of internment (n)	303	121	182
Range of days	1–2509	3–2509	1–2147
Mean	363.22	350.32	371.80
Median	227.00	190.00	249.00
Std. deviation	405.03	426.95	390.74
Weight variation (n)	104	104	–
Weight range (kg)	–10.5 to 41.5	–10.5 to 41.5	–
Mean	7.50	7.50	–
Median	6.25	6.25	–
Std. deviation	7.98	7.98	–
Death (n)	299	121	178
Number of patients died	42	22	20
% within groups	14.0%	18.2%	11.2%

( $t = 1.120$ ,  $df = 273.34$ ,  $p = 0.26$ ), respectively 40.20 years for CP patients and 38.77 years for IANT ones. This age span and mean age at admission do not correspond to the morbidity and mortality profiles of pulmonary TB in the Portuguese population since the majority of the SCVP patients, both from CP and IANT, were workers and, therefore, non-adults are clearly underrepresented. The Portuguese official statistics reveal that during the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century pulmonary TB had a predilection for young adults although individuals from all ages could be affected (contrary to some other forms of tuberculosis, e.g. tuberculous meningitis which had a higher incidence in non-adults). The high incidence of this disease in ages between 15 and 55 years old clearly represented a social problem, since this was the most active phase [8].

### 3.2. Duration of the internment

The duration of the internment at the SCVP ranged from 1 to 2509 days (Table 1). The longest stay lasted approximately seven years while short duration internments, corresponding to one week or less, occurred only in 6 patients: one from the CP period, who died 3 days after admission, and the remaining 5 belonged to the period after antibiotics (namely 4 patients who renounced the internment and the remaining one passed away 4 h after his arrival). The sanatorium regime usually required a long period of internment and, in fact, the overall mean duration of the treatment was 363.22 days.

There are no significant differences regarding the duration of internment between the two periods ( $U = 10,386.5$ ,  $p = 0.40$ ), however, the mean and median are both higher for IANT patients (respectively 371.8 and 249.0 days) when compared with CP ones (respectively 350.32 and 190.0 days). This finding is unexpected since antibiotics were already in use in the sanatorium during the IANT period and the global trend was that the care provided on sanatoria became more medicalized and less palliative [9]. There are a few possible explanations for this scenario: the patients usually were admitted in poor physical conditions and, despite the existence of antibiotics, only a long period of internment could be beneficial to their recovery; the better medical knowledge and diagnosis methods prevented false cures and in consequence shorter internment periods; and/or patients only left the SCVP after finishing the antibiotic treatment.

There are no comparative data from other Portuguese sanatoria regarding the duration of the internment. However, the official national statistics reveal that between 1909 and 1910 the majority of tuberculous patients under treatment at the Sanatorium Sousa Martins (the first public sanatorium for the treatment of pulmonary TB created in Portugal) stayed less than one year.

Developed by the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century, the practice of the 'hygienic triad', comprising good air, good rest and good food, was still practiced at the SCVP in 1956 as depicted in the schedule of the patients. During the day, besides plenty of fresh air and sun exposure, patients rested a total of 7 h distributed into 3 periods, one of these in absolute silence, and, additionally, 5 meals were served.

The benefits of the internment on the SCVP were variable although the general health status of some patients improved radically. The weight variation can be regarded as a proxy for the effectiveness of the sanatorium regime. This variable is available only for the patients from the CP period (Table 1). The weight variation ranged from the loss of 10.5 kg to the gain of 41.5 kg, and the overall mean was the gain of 7.50 kg [1]. Only 9.62% (10/104) of the patients lost weight. Before antibiotherapy the gain of weight during the internment was considered by physicians a promising sign of a future clinical cure from pulmonary TB [10]. Unluckily, there is no data about this parameter for IANT patients.

Download English Version:

<https://daneshyari.com/en/article/2401475>

Download Persian Version:

<https://daneshyari.com/article/2401475>

[Daneshyari.com](https://daneshyari.com)