



Review article

Functional neuroanatomy of meditation: A review and meta-analysis of 78 functional neuroimaging investigations



Kieran C.R. Fox^{a,*}, Matthew L. Dixon^a, Savannah Nijeboer^a, Manesh Girn^a,
James L. Floman^b, Michael Lifshitz^c, Melissa Ellamil^d, Peter Sedlmeier^e,
Kalina Christoff^{a,f}

^a Department of Psychology, University of British Columbia, 2136 West Mall, Vancouver, B.C., V6T 1Z4, Canada

^b Department of Educational and Counselling Psychology, and Special Education, University of British Columbia, 2125 Main Mall, Vancouver, B.C., V6T 1Z4, Canada

^c Integrated Program in Neuroscience, McGill University, 3775 University St., Montreal, QC, H3A 2B4, Canada

^d Neuroanatomy and Connectivity Research Group, Max Planck Institute for Human Cognitive and Brain Sciences, Stephanstrasse 1a, Leipzig, 04103, Germany

^e Institut für Psychologie, Technische Universität Chemnitz, 43 Wilhelm-Raabe Street, Chemnitz, Germany

^f Brain Research Centre, University of British Columbia, 2211 Wesbrook Mall, Vancouver, B.C., V6T 2B5, Canada

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 7 October 2015

Received in revised form 25 February 2016

Accepted 1 March 2016

Available online 28 March 2016

Keywords:

Meditation

Open monitoring

Focused attention

Functional magnetic resonance imaging

Meta-analysis

Activation likelihood estimation

ABSTRACT

Meditation is a family of mental practices that encompasses a wide array of techniques employing distinctive mental strategies. We systematically reviewed 78 functional neuroimaging (fMRI and PET) studies of meditation, and used activation likelihood estimation to meta-analyze 257 peak foci from 31 experiments involving 527 participants. We found reliably dissociable patterns of brain activation and deactivation for four common styles of meditation (focused attention, mantra recitation, open monitoring, and compassion/loving-kindness), and suggestive differences for three others (visualization, sense-withdrawal, and non-dual awareness practices). Overall, dissociable activation patterns are congruent with the psychological and behavioral aims of each practice. Some brain areas are recruited consistently across multiple techniques—including insula, pre/supplementary motor cortices, dorsal anterior cingulate cortex, and frontopolar cortex—but convergence is the exception rather than the rule. A preliminary effect-size meta-analysis found medium effects for both activations ($d = 0.59$) and deactivations ($d = -0.74$), suggesting potential practical significance. Our meta-analysis supports the neurophysiological dissociability of meditation practices, but also raises many methodological concerns and suggests avenues for future research.

© 2016 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

Contents

1. Introduction	209
1.1. Functional neuroimaging of meditation: the need for quantitative meta-analysis	210
1.2. Four general categories of meditation	211
1.2.1. Focused attention meditation	211
1.2.2. Mantra recitation meditation	211
1.2.3. Open monitoring meditation	211
1.2.4. Loving-kindness and compassion meditations	211
1.3. Other forms of meditation	212
1.4. Delineating reliable neural correlates of different meditation practices	212
1.5. Are the effects of meditation practices on brain function of any practical significance?	213

* Corresponding author.

E-mail address: kfox@psych.ubc.ca (K.C.R. Fox).

2.	Meta-analytic methods.....	213
2.1.	Literature review.....	213
2.1.1.	Search strategy.....	213
2.1.2.	Study inclusion and exclusion criteria.....	214
2.1.3.	Study classification.....	214
2.2.	The question of baselines, control conditions, and tasks engaged in during meditation.....	214
2.3.	Reporting and classification of results.....	214
2.4.	Activation likelihood estimation (ALE) meta-analysis.....	214
2.4.1.	General methods.....	214
2.4.2.	Primary neuroimaging meta-analyses.....	214
2.5.	Effect size meta-analysis.....	215
2.6.	Estimating publication bias in meta-analytic results.....	215
3.	Results I: neuroimaging meta-analysis.....	215
3.1.	Focused attention meditation.....	215
3.2.	Mantra recitation meditation.....	215
3.3.	Open monitoring meditation.....	217
3.4.	Loving-kindness and compassion meditation.....	217
4.	Results II: effect size meta-analysis.....	217
5.	Discussion, future directions, and conclusions.....	217
5.1.	Overview.....	217
5.2.	Functional neuroanatomy of focused attention meditation.....	219
5.2.1.	Activations.....	219
5.2.2.	Deactivations.....	220
5.3.	Functional neuroanatomy of mantra recitation meditation.....	220
5.3.1.	Activations.....	220
5.3.2.	Deactivations.....	220
5.4.	Functional neuroanatomy of open monitoring meditation.....	220
5.4.1.	Activations.....	220
5.4.2.	Deactivations.....	220
5.5.	Functional neuroanatomy of loving-kindness and compassion meditation.....	220
5.5.1.	Activations.....	220
5.5.2.	Deactivations.....	221
5.6.	Convergent findings across meditation categories.....	221
5.6.1.	Insular cortex.....	221
5.6.2.	Premotor cortex and supplementary motor area (lateral/medial BA 6).....	221
5.6.3.	Dorsal anterior/mid cingulate cortex.....	221
5.6.4.	Frontopolar cortex/rostrolateral prefrontal cortex.....	221
5.7.	Other meditation practices: further evidence for dissociability at the neural level.....	222
5.8.	Are contemplative practices dissociable by electrophysiological and neurochemical measures?.....	222
5.9.	Do functional neural effects associated with meditation have practical significance?.....	222
5.10.	Meditation, the brain, and clinical disorders.....	223
5.11.	Meta-analytic limitations.....	223
5.12.	Other methodological challenges in the neuroimaging of meditation.....	224
5.12.1.	Lifestyle variables.....	224
5.12.2.	Pre-existing differences in brain structure and function.....	225
5.12.3.	'Overshadowing'.....	225
5.12.4.	Enduring trait differences in brain and cognitive function.....	225
5.12.5.	Integration of functional neuroimaging methods with behavioral measures.....	225
5.13.	Summary and conclusions.....	225
	Acknowledgments.....	225
	Appendix A. Supplementary data.....	226
	References.....	226

1. Introduction

Meditation has been used as a tool to train the mind for thousands of years (Analayo, 2003; Iyengar, 2005). Broadly speaking, meditation practices involve the monitoring and regulation of attention and emotion (Lutz et al., 2008b; Tang et al., 2015). Meditation can be either directed outward to particular objects and sensory stimuli or turned inward to the workings of the mind and felt experiences of the body. A common principle across all forms of meditation is that through specific and regular practice, the ability to monitor and regulate mental-physical processes can be progressively developed—the way performance on any other cognitive or motor skill can be improved with practice (Ericsson et al., 1993; Slagter et al., 2011; Vago, 2014). Interest in the neural basis of meditative practices has increased enormously over the past decade,

and mounting empirical evidence suggests that meditation indeed leads to or is associated with significant changes in cognitive and affective processing (Sedlmeier et al., 2012), as well as alterations in brain structure (Fox et al., 2014) and function (Cahn and Polich, 2006).

Although meditative practices now garner serious interest from the cognitive neuroscience community (Fig. 1), meditation still tends to be viewed as a somewhat uniform practice (e.g., Sperduti et al., 2012). The umbrella-term 'meditation' encompasses a wide variety of distinct practices with specific goals and methods, however. The varying methods and scope of particular forms of meditation include focalizing and sustaining attention (Wallace, 2006), generating and maintaining complex visual imagery (Kozhevnikov et al., 2009), improving emotion regu-

Download English Version:

<https://daneshyari.com/en/article/7302881>

Download Persian Version:

<https://daneshyari.com/article/7302881>

[Daneshyari.com](https://daneshyari.com)